

TANZANIA VOTES: ELECTIONS ANNULLED IN ZANZIBAR

By Alexander Noyes

On October 25, 2015, Tanzanians went to the polls. Although it was the country's most competitive election to date, the ruling Chama Cha Mapinduzi (CCM) party was able to hold onto power with their presidential candidate, John Magufuli, [receiving](#) 58 percent of the vote. An opposition coalition candidate, Edward Lowassa, garnered 40 percent. While the elections were generally [deemed](#) free and fair by international observers, things quickly took a turn for the worse in the semi-autonomous island region of Zanzibar, which also held elections. Alleging irregularities, Zanzibar's electoral commission annulled the region's elections after the opposition candidate declared victory, precipitating an electoral crisis. [more...](#)



In this photo taken Monday, Oct. 26, 2015, police special forces ride in the back of a vehicle with unidentified men they had arrested, in the Darajani area of Stone Town, Zanzibar. Zanzibar's election commission chief announced that the results of the island archipelago's presidential election have been nullified because of alleged irregularities, saying that the decision was taken because of several issues with the voting process. (Source: AP Photo.)

Alexander Noyes is an Adjunct Research Associate in the Africa Program at the Institute for Defense Analyses.

AFRICA AND INDIA—RELATIONS IN A NEW PHASE

By George F. Ward

Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi put on quite a party in New Delhi recently, and representatives of 54 sub-Saharan African countries showed up. Over 40 African heads of state or government attended the Third India-Africa Forum Summit from October 26 to 29, 2015. China, obviously not present at the summit, was nevertheless [on the minds of observers](#). They wondered whether, with China's Africa engagement seemingly on pause (see the [October 22, 2015](#) issue of *Africa Watch*), India may be in a position to take up the slack. [more...](#)



Nigeria's President Muhammadu Buhari, center, attends the India Africa Forum Summit in New Delhi, India, Thursday, Oct. 29, 2015. Indian Prime Minister Modi described India and Africa as bright spots of hope and economic opportunity and offered technology and credit in an effort to match rival China's influence over the continent at a summit with more than 40 African leaders Thursday. (Source: AP Photo/Saurabh Das.)

Ambassador (ret.) George F. Ward is editor of *Africa Watch* and a Research Staff Member at the Institute for Defense Analyses.

About IDA

The Institute for Defense Analyses is a non-profit corporation operating in the public interest.

IDA's three federally-funded research and development centers provide objective analyses of national security issues and related national challenges, particularly those requiring scientific and technical expertise.

IDA's Africa team focuses on issues related to political, economic, and social stability and security on the continent.

TANZANIA VOTES: ELECTIONS ANNULLED IN ZANZIBAR

By Alexander Noyes

On October 25, 2015, Tanzanians went to the polls. Although it was the country's most competitive election to date, the ruling Chama Cha Mapinduzi (CCM) party was able to hold onto power with their presidential candidate, John Magufuli, [receiving](#) 58 percent of the vote. An opposition coalition candidate, Edward Lowassa, garnered 40 percent. While the elections were generally [deemed](#) free and fair by international observers, things quickly took a turn for the worse in the semi-autonomous island region of Zanzibar, which also held elections. Alleging irregularities, Zanzibar's electoral commission annulled the region's elections after the opposition candidate declared victory, precipitating an electoral crisis.

Zanzibar's Troubled Election History

Zanzibar is a semiautonomous island region located off the northeast of mainland Tanzania. It consists primarily of the islands of Unguja and Pemba. While mainland Tanzania is known for its record of peace and stability in a volatile neighborhood, Zanzibar has an extended history of election-related violence. Allegations of fraud and violent flare-ups between the CCM party and the Civic United Front (CUF)—the main opposition party—surrounded the 1995, 2000, and 2005 elections.

Before the 2010 elections, some headway was made on political [reconciliation](#), as a government of national unity (GNU) ensured both parties would have a stake in governance, no matter the outcome of elections. After a peaceful but tightly contested vote in 2010, a GNU was formed between CCM and CUF. Ali Mohamed Shein of CCM narrowly won the presidency, while Seif Shariff Hamad of CUF, as the second-place finisher, assumed the position of first vice president. As highlighted in the September 3, 2015 [edition](#) of *Africa Watch*, despite some progress under the GNU, political tensions reemerged ahead of the October 25 vote.

2015 Polls Annulled

The October 25 election was largely [peaceful](#) and orderly in Zanzibar. A day after the polls closed, CUF's candidate, Hamad, [declared](#) that he had won, based on his party's vote tabulations, a claim that was refuted and called illegal by CCM. Hamad's declaration led to CUF supporters celebrating in the streets, where they were met with tear gas from the police. On October 27, the army surrounded the Zanzibar Electoral Commission (ZEC) building as votes were still being counted. Sensing something was afoot, Hamad [asserted](#) that he would "not concede defeat if robbed of my victory." On October 28, the ZEC [annulled](#) the election results, citing gross irregularities, especially on the island of Pemba, a CUF stronghold. The ZEC chairman, Jecha Salim Jecha, [announced](#): "The process was not fair and had breaches of the law . . . I declare all the results to be null and void." Fresh elections are planned in 90 days.

Domestic and International Fallout

After the annulment, fears of violence escalated as police found several homemade [explosive](#) devices, and a number of homes were burned. CUF [alleged](#) that 16 people had been injured in clashes. Following the ZEC's annulment, Hamad [said](#), "We are telling CCM that we know what you are up to and we are not going to accept it . . . the people of Zanzibar have had enough of this entire situation and are losing their patience." International election [observers](#) also criticized the annulment and urged Tanzania to resolve the crisis quickly. The U.S. embassy in Tanzania expressed grave concern and [requested](#) that the annulment decision be reversed: "We call for this announcement to be recalled, and urge all parties to maintain a commitment to a transparent and peaceful democratic process."



In this photo taken Monday, Oct. 26, 2015, police special forces ride in the back of a vehicle with unidentified men they had arrested, in the Darajani area of Stone Town, Zanzibar. Zanzibar's election commission chief announced that the results of the island archipelago's presidential election have been nullified because of alleged irregularities, saying that the decision was taken because of several issues with the voting process. (Source: AP Photo.)

A multilateral negotiation process is now under way to resolve the political crisis, with assistance from the United Nations and a [group](#) of countries referred to as “Friends of Tanzania.” While initially promising protests if his alleged victory was not recognized, Hamad on November 2 urged his supporters to remain calm and voiced confidence in a negotiated resolution. “I ask CUF fans and Zanzibaris to remain calm and observe peace—diplomatic efforts have been going on well ... Let us be patient, as the international community is also helping to have Zanzibar’s political crisis resolved.” Tanzania’s outgoing president, Jakaya Kikwete, is also reportedly involved. He released a statement on November 1 [saying](#) he is “working tirelessly and consulting widely over the last few days to find an amicable and peaceful resolution to the situation in Zanzibar.”

Conclusion: Another GNU?

An independent [assessment](#) by political scientist Keith Weghorst compared CUF’s unofficial vote tabulation with the partial official results released by the ZEC, concluding that CUF’s numbers were more or less accurate. Weghorst finds that, if anything, Hamad actually underestimated his support. It appears that Hamad has the numbers on his side. This suggests that the ZEC’s fraud claims and annulment may have been a power grab by CCM, aimed at preventing a CUF win on the islands. While CCM may at some point attempt to paint the ZEC actions as rogue, CCM has openly [supported](#) the annulment. The GNU provision in Zanzibar’s constitution would provide CCM with a stake in the next government, even if it lost. So why does CCM care so much about remaining in power in tiny Zanzibar? One major reason is that bitter disagreements between the parties over a delayed [constitutional reform](#) process added greater stakes to this election, as a CUF victory could well lead to more constitutional autonomy for Zanzibar (which is favored by most Zanzibaris).

Given Hamad’s seemingly genuine victory, uniform condemnation by the international community, and the real threat of protests and potential widespread violence, it appears that CCM overstepped in Zanzibar and is now searching for a way out that allows the party to save face. While the situation remains fluid, a possible outcome of negotiations is another GNU, with CCM as a junior partner. Even if a settlement is successfully negotiated, the flawed election process raises several red flags for electoral management in Tanzania. Such flags include premature declarations of victory by opposition candidates in both the mainland and Zanzibar and CCM’s willingness to resort to extra-constitutional measures to remain in power. A number of electoral reforms might be considered, including a revamped and independent ZEC.

Alexander Noyes is an Adjunct Research Associate in the Africa Program at the Institute for Defense Analyses.

AFRICA AND INDIA—RELATIONS IN A NEW PHASE

By George F. Ward

Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi put on quite a party in New Delhi recently, and representatives of 54 sub-Saharan African countries showed up. Over 40 African heads of state or government attended the Third India-Africa Forum Summit from October 26 to 29, 2015. China, obviously not present at the summit, was nevertheless [on the minds of observers](#). They wondered whether, with China's Africa engagement seemingly on pause (see the [October 22, 2015](#) issue of *Africa Watch*), India may be in a position to take up the slack.

An Ambitious Summit for a Growing Relationship

The first two India-Africa summit meetings—New Delhi in 2008 and Addis Ababa in 2011—were fairly modest affairs attended by a relatively small number of African governments. This year's edition was anything but modest. Over 2,000 African delegates attended and participated in separate meetings for senior officials, foreign ministers, and heads of state and government. In between, there were social events and cultural performances. At the meeting, Prime Minister Modi [stressed](#) the importance India's relationship with Africa: "The relations between India and the countries of Africa, these relations and these bonds that we have, are not just political and economic but we also have a very rich cultural tradition." In public, Modi did his best to play down comparisons with China, [saying](#), "Our relationship with Africa is unique and does not need any point of reference."

Prime Minister Modi was wise to stress the cultural aspects of the Indian relationship with Africa, if only because economic relations, although expanding, are still much less extensive than those of China. India is Africa's [fourth-largest trading partner](#), after China, the European Union, and the United States. China's lead is commanding, with its two-way trade with Africa reaching almost [\\$222 billion in 2014](#). The comparable number for India was [\\$71 billion](#), an increase from [\\$25 billion in 2006](#). Like China, India imports a great deal of crude petroleum from Africa. Angola is China's preferred partner in the oil trade, while Nigeria plays that role for India. Also like China, [India exports](#) manufactured goods for both the industrial and consumer markets to Africa. In the high-tech area, China is dominant in electronic goods, while India has developed a significant African market for its pharmaceuticals.

What Happened at the Summit?

The summit was about more than cultural performances and speeches. The Indian government made pledges of significant economic assistance to Africa. Two summit documents included support for some of India's key international diplomatic and political objectives. The documents also outlined an extensive program of cooperation in a variety of fields, including agriculture, the environment, education, and health.

In concrete terms, India [pledged](#) to provide African countries with \$10 billion in concessional loans over the next five years. In addition, India will provide \$600 million in grant aid and 50,000 scholarships for study in India over the same period. Although these amounts are relatively modest in absolute terms, they are evidence of India's willingness to make new commitments to Africa at a time when other partners are retrenching. The [India-Africa Framework for Strategic Cooperation](#), one of the two principal summit documents, includes detail on specific cooperative endeavors in a number of fields planned for the next five years.

The [Delhi Declaration 2015](#), the second document agreed to at the meeting, addresses a variety of themes, but focuses mainly on the political, including some of particular importance for India. The Declaration takes off from the statement, "Indians



Nigeria's President Muhammadu Buhari, center, attends the India Africa Forum Summit in New Delhi, India, Thursday, Oct. 29, 2015. Indian Prime Minister Modi described India and Africa as bright spots of hope and economic opportunity and offered technology and credit in an effort to match rival China's influence over the continent at a summit with more than 40 African leaders Thursday. (Source: AP Photo/Saurabh Das.)

and Africans together comprise nearly one-third of humanity today,” and goes on to demand international action to achieve more democratic global governance. In another expression of developing-country solidarity, the summit participants called upon the developed nations to provide the financial resources and technology needed by developing countries to cope with the impacts of climate change. The document commits summit participants to support the reform and enlargement of the United Nations Security Council (UNSC). Interestingly, however, India did not receive African support for permanent membership on the UNSC, which is a major Indian foreign policy goal. The Declaration states only that participants “noted” each other’s positions on UNSC reform.

Did the Summit Matter?

As the summit was convening in New Delhi, Sanusha Naidu, a researcher at a South African think tank, noted the [lack of attention](#) to the event in African media and among commentators. Naidu opined that it was impossible to discern what African leaders expected from the summit or to make out any strategic plan on the African side. A scan of media coverage before, during, and after the summit confirms Naidu’s point. The Indian press and electronic media covered the summit heavily, posting many articles on various aspects of the event. Attention was also paid to the summit in international media, garnering both financial and general interest. In contrast, little notice was given to the summit by African sources of news and comment. Before the summit, South Africa’s Institute for Security Studies (ISS) posted a [commentary](#). Coverage in Africa of the summit itself was sparse, with as much attention given to the [stumble](#) by Zimbabwe’s nonagenarian President Robert Mugabe on his way to the speaker’s podium as to most other aspects of the event.

One can only speculate about the reasons for the lack of attention by Africans to a significant milestone in a partnership that is of growing importance. One factor may be that Africans and African governments are becoming jaded by summits. In the relatively recent past, the American, Chinese, and Japanese governments have hosted African leaders for summit meetings. Another [China-Africa summit](#) is scheduled for South Africa in December 2015. A second factor may be that the Indian presence in Africa is simply less visible on a day-to-day basis than that of the Chinese. Over a million Chinese currently live on the continent, and they are present in virtually every country. In contrast, Indians and Africans of Indian descent, although numerous, are concentrated in only a few African countries, such as Mauritius, Kenya, and South Africa. Finally, there is a difference in [economic scale](#). China is the world’s second-largest economy, while India is in tenth place. China’s trade with Africa is three times that of India. In the end, China plays a role in the daily lives of Africans, while India does not. In sum, the Third India-Africa Forum Summit was a landmark in a relationship that still has plenty of room to grow.

Ambassador (ret.) George F. Ward is editor of Africa Watch and a Research Staff Member at the Institute for Defense Analyses.
